

Report of the Assistant Director of Governance & ICT

Draft Annual Scrutiny Report 2013-14

Summary

1. This annual scrutiny report summarises the work of the five Overview & Scrutiny Committees for the municipal year May 2013 – May 2014, and asks Members to agree the report prior to its presentation to Cabinet in July 2014.

Background

2. This committee is charged with monitoring overall performance in relation to scrutiny review work and providing an annual report to Full Council. The last annual report for the period June 2012 – May 2013 was presented to this Committee in September 2013 and to Council in October 2013.

Consultation

3. Consultation was not required for the production of this annual report. However, consultation is an important element of Overview & Scrutiny and is regularly carried out in support of all scrutiny reviews.
4. The final reports produced for each of the reviews completed during the period June 2013 – May 2014 detail all of the work undertaken, including any consultation carried out. Those final reports and all supporting information can be viewed in full at:

<http://democracy.york.gov.uk/ecCatDisplay.aspx?sch=doc&cat=13029&path=13028>

Options

5. Having considered the Annual Report, Members may choose to:
 - Agree any amendments required to the report

- Approve the report for presentation to the meeting of Full Council in July 2014.

Scrutiny Reviews in 2013-14

6. Corporate Scrutiny Review
In June 2013, Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee expressed an interest in carrying out a corporate scrutiny review during the 2013-14 municipal year to which each of the Overview & Scrutiny Committees could contribute.
7. The Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee considered two topics which cut across the remits of all the scrutiny committees (Improving York's Night-Time Economy and Impacts of Mental Health) and chose to proceed with a corporate review on York's Night Time Economy (NTE) based on its connection to a number of the Council's current key priorities in the Council Plan 2011-2015.
8. Each Overview & Scrutiny Committee was tasked with identifying a suitable review remit, based on their individual terms of reference, which led to the following reviews being undertaken:
 - Economic & City Development (ECSOSC) – to encourage longer retail opening hours and enhance evening access in and out of the city centre;
 - Health – to identify the impact of the night-time economy on the Emergency Department at York Hospital at peak times;
 - Community Safety – to examine ways to improve the attractiveness and cleanliness of the city centre in the evening;
 - Learning and Culture – to identify an improved cultural offer up to 8pm in order to extend the tourist day and encourage more tourists to stay for longer or overnight, with particular emphasis on families.
9. To support the night-time economy corporate review an online survey 'Yorkafter5' was undertaken in late Autumn 2013 which included questions in support of all the reviews except the health related review for which separate surveys were agreed.
10. The ECSOSC review gathered information on cities similar to York to establish a benchmark for the night-time economy and to establish best practice elsewhere. Key partners, including representatives of York Retail Forum, the Federation of Small Businesses, City Team York, bus companies and private hire federations were also involved in the review.

11. Members of the Health OSC met with officials at York Hospital to gather information related to peaks in Emergency Department admissions, particularly late Friday night / early Saturday mornings and late Saturday night / early Sunday mornings. They also met with representatives from Yorkshire Ambulance Service; NHS Trust; the Vale of York Clinical Commissioning Group and Street Angels, and received information from the GP Out of Hours Service. Committee Members also spent two nights in the hospital Emergency Department to witness the work of the department and any difficulties staff faced.
12. The Community Safety OSC chose not to carry out a review on anti-social behaviour associated with the city centre night-time economy, having agreed any such review would duplicate work of AVANTE (Alcohol and Violence in the Night-Time Economy), a multi-agency task group of the Safer York Partnership. Instead they agreed to focus their review on city centre street cleaning and associated issues related to commercial waste presentation and miss-use of flyers, which both lead to additional work for the city centre street cleaning teams. However in light of the limited time available for a full and proper review, the Committee recommended that work to address these ongoing issues be undertaken as a matter of priority by Public Realm officers working with CYC Waste Services and Safer York Partnership.
13. At the beginning of the municipal year the Learning and Culture OSC, learnt of work already underway by the Council and its partners on a new high-level tourism strategy for the city, and of an application for funding to Visit England/Arts Council England. The Committee agreed to postpone their NTE review until the outcome of the funding application was known, recognising it would directly affect their choice of topic. In February 2014, having learnt that the application for funding had been unsuccessful, the Task Group agreed to look at how the tourist day might be extended and residents encouraged to visit the city between 5-8pm. They also met the Consortium behind the bid to investigate what elements within the application individual organisations would be taking forward.
14. The NTE final reports from Economic & City Development, Health and Community Safety Committees were presented to CSMC in March 2014 while the Learning and Culture Committee presented their report in early April 2014. CSMC set up a Task Group to collate the findings from the individual reviews and package the draft recommendations, enabling the NTE Corporate Review final report to be presented to Cabinet in early May 2014. Overall CSMC were pleased with the outcome of the corporate review recognising the work of all those involved, and agreed

to repeat the corporate approach in future years to ensure continuing corporate and city-wide engagement with scrutiny.

15. Other Committee Reviews:

The following scrutiny reviews were also carried out by the Overview & Scrutiny Committees in the last municipal year:

- Equalities Review

In November 2013 CSMC agreed to proceed with a review to raise awareness of the democratic process amongst York's Communities of Identity, and identify any required equalities training for Members. A Task Group was set up and it intends holding a consultation event at the Mansion House at the end of June 2014 to meet with representatives from York's minority communities to raise awareness of the democratic process, ways of getting involved, and to identify any barriers preventing their community engagement/involvement. Work on the review is expected to be concluded by early September 2014.

- External Funding Scrutiny Review

In January 2013 an ECDOSC Task Group commenced a review into ways of unlocking potential external funding for economic development and regeneration projects. Its key objectives were to assess Leeds City Region's investment priorities, what resources were available to City of York Council and to present a strong case to attract funding for York's top investment priorities. Over a series of meetings the Task Group gathered evidence which led to a number of strategic recommendations being agreed by ECDOSC in September 2013 and presented to Cabinet in November 2013.

- Construction Skills Scrutiny Review

In July 2013 an ECDOSC Task Group was set up to investigate a national and, particularly, northern England shortage of skilled builders and to see what the Council and its partners could do to address this skills gap and prepare for future growth. After examining the existing training provision and funding landscape the Task Group received details of the current situation in York, information on best practice in other local authorities and feedback from employers. Task Group Members also took part in meetings with the Property Forum of York's Chamber of Commerce, YorCity Construction and York College at which they spoke to current apprentices to identify possible obstacles to the recruitment process. The Task Group's final report was endorsed by ECDOSC in March 2014 and went to Cabinet on 6 May 2014.

- Online Business / E-Commerce Scrutiny Review
 An ECDOSC Task Group was formed in January 2014 to identify how CYC may better support city businesses to develop their online opportunities and improve their sales, marketing and profitability. To identify any gaps in this support an online survey was launched asking businesses for feedback and the Task Group also received information on how other towns and cities are supporting the development of online business opportunities. The Task Group expect their work to be completed in the summer of 2014.
- Domestic Waste Recycling Scrutiny Review
 In July 2012, the Community Safety OSC set up a Task Group to look at ways of increasing domestic waste recycling. The Task Group carried out an analysis of the recycling rates for the 20 top performing Local Authorities in order to identify best practice. The Task Group agreed to focus their work in support of the council's 2013-14 'Recycle More' initiative, which led to delays in the review whilst the work on that initiative was undertaken. The second phase of a major piece of work to gather evidence on the effectiveness of initiatives employed to improve kerbside recycling and reduce the amount of waste sent to landfill was scheduled between January and March 2014. Work is now underway to evaluate the impact of that work and the review final report is expected by July 2014.
- A-Boards Scrutiny Review
 In April 2013 the Community Safety OSC, having considered information on the implications associated with implementing a total ban on the use of A-boards, agreed to proceed with a scrutiny review to identify some sensible guidelines for the use of A-boards across the whole city. A public consultation event was held on 5 February 2014 and the Task Group is working with key stakeholders and businesses to draft guidance for the future use of A-Boards. The review is ongoing and completion is expected summer 2014.
- Community Mental Health Services & Care of Young People Scrutiny Review
 A Health Scrutiny Task Group was set up in November 2012 to raise awareness of emotional and mental health issues for young people, and the services and interventions available, with a view to ensuring that the wider children's workforce are well informed and equipped to identify and respond to children and young people with emotional problems and/or emerging mental health issues. The review looked at ways of improving multi-agency working, and encouraged York secondary schools to introduce a Mental Health School Charter,

setting out what strategies, resources and support systems were in place to help pupils, carers and support staff to identify and cope with emerging emotional or mental health issues. The review final report was presented to Cabinet in December 2013.

- Personalisation Security Review

In July 2012 a Health Scrutiny Task Group commenced a review around take up and administration of personal budgets so people could exercise as much choice and control over their lives as possible. In an effort to identify key priorities around personalisation and make improvements, the review brought together residents, and service and support providers, to identify the areas of strength and weakness in City of York Council's approach to personalisation. The review included two workshops facilitated by an independent consultant and CYC commissioned a POET (Personal Outcomes and Evaluation Tool) survey, carried out by In Control - a national charity which helps people to live the life they choose - to collect and compare data from personal budget holders in the area. A representative from In Control attended a February 2014 Task Group meeting to help establish priority areas and clarify any implications associated with them. The review final report was signed off by Health OSC in April 2014 and presented to Cabinet in May 2014.

- Men's Health Scrutiny Review

In July 2013 the Health OSC received a verbal report which highlighted that the bottom 20% of men in York had been "cast adrift" and had significantly different and poorer life expectancy. The Committee formed a Task Group to establish the main causes of premature male deaths and analyse ways in which the most vulnerable could be targeted. Having received detailed information from CYC's Consultant in Public Health the Task Group recommended the topic should not be progressed as the review was too wide ranging and that meaningful work on the topic could not be done over the period of a municipal year. It was therefore agreed, the topic could be re-considered at a later date.

- Careers Education Information and Guidance (CEIAG) Task Group Scrutiny Review

In early 2013 a Learning & Culture Task Group was set up to assess the standard of CEIAG for young people in York, and where appropriate identify improvements. The Task Group held a number of consultation meetings with training providers, partner agencies, business and local authority representatives, and young people as they gathered evidence in support of the review. The Task Group's

conclusions and the recommendations were endorsed by the Learning & Culture OSC in September 2013 and presented to Cabinet in November 2013.

- School Meals Scrutiny Review

In June 2013, the Learning & Culture OSC agreed a scrutiny topic on the take up of school meals, and free school meals and set up a Task Group to investigate how to improve take-up. Shortly after the review started, the Government announced its plans to provide free school meals for all infants. The Task Group recognised this would lead to a substantial increase in the numbers receiving a school meal, and requested additional information to understand the knock on effects on schools and on the council's current contract. They met with representatives from the Local Authority's school meal provider and received detailed information on the contract and the challenges the provider had faced since taking up the contract three years earlier. In September 2013, the Task Group met with representatives of the Youth Council to gather their views on school meals. They also carried out a number of school visits and gathered the views of parents. The Task Group's draft final report was signed off by Learning and Culture OSC in March 2014, and presented to Cabinet in May 2014.

Supporting the Council Plan 2011-15

16. All of the reviews carried out during 2013-14 (identified above) took account of the Council's need to be inclusive and ensure equality in accessing the services being reviewed. Each review also supported a number of the council's other improvement priorities and direction statements:
17. The following reviews were directly linked to the 'Protect Vulnerable People' element of the Council Plan 2011-15:
 - Night-Time Economy Review;
 - School Meals Review;
 - Community Mental Health Services and Care of Young People Review;
 - Personalisation Review;
 - Men's Health Review;
 - A-Boards Review.
18. The following reviews were directly linked to the 'Build Strong Communities' element of the Council Plan 2011-15:

- Night-Time Economy Review
19. The following reviews were directly linked to the 'Create Jobs & Grow the Economy' element of the Council Plan 2011-15:
- Night-Time Economy Review;
 - External Funding Review;
 - Construction Skills Review;
 - Online Business / E-Commerce Review.
20. The Domestic Waste Recycling Review supported the 'Protect the Environment' element of the Council Plan 2011-15.
21. Finally, whilst the CEIAG review did not directly support the priorities within the Council Plan 2011-15, it did support a recommendation within the Children & Young People's Plan made by young researchers that asked for careers information and advice to be age appropriate, and for increased links between businesses and education.

Finance & Performance Monitoring

22. Throughout 2013-14 the Overview & Scrutiny Committees received regular quarterly monitoring reports relating to the council's performance and finance management, in service areas specific to their individual remits.
23. In addition, they also received other monitoring reports specific to their individual terms of reference, as detailed below:
24. Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee received presentations / updates on:
- The Workforce Strategy 2012-15;
 - The Annual Scrutiny Support Budget;
 - The Procurement Strategy;
 - Evaluation of the Service to City Programme;
 - The Council's Journey to Excellence in Equalities;
 - The Workplace Wellbeing Survey 2013.
 - The Annual Overview & Scrutiny Report for 2012-13;
25. The Community Safety Overview & Scrutiny Committee received updates on:
- Domestic Violence;

- The work of AVANTE (Alcohol & Violence in the Night-Time Economy);
- Tethered Horses Policy;
- Winter Maintenance Procedures.
- Bi-annual performance reports from Safer York Partnership (SYP),

26. Community Safety Overview & Scrutiny Committee also met with the Police & Crime Commissioner and representatives from Safer York Partnership, the Probation Service, the Police and Crime Panel and the York and North Yorkshire Fire & Rescue Service in relation to their role of scrutineers of crime & disorder issues.

27. The Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee received briefings/updates on:

- Major developments within the city;
- Major transport initiatives and issues arising from them;
- Local Enterprise Partnerships (LEPs);
- Tour de France Grand Depart;
- Green Travel Plans;
- Newgate Market;
- Lendal Bridge trial.
- Council for Voluntary Services
- Volunteering Opportunities for Under 16s
- York Charter for Volunteering

28. The Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee has a statutory role to review and scrutinise the impact of services and policies of key partners on the health of the city's population. As such it received updates on:

- The implementation of the NHS 111 service;
- Children's Cardiac Services;
- Safeguarding Arrangements;
- The Public Health Service Plan;
- Section 136 of the Mental Health Act – Provision of a Place of Safety;
- Friends and Family Test – Maternity Services;
- Winter Pressures Money;
- Carers' Strategy;
- Residential, Nursing and Home Care Services;
- The merger of Priory Medical Group Surgery and Abbey Medical Group;
- Partnership Working in mental health services;
- The way older people's mental health services are provided.

29. The Committee were also consulted on a number of issues:

- Changes to psychological therapies services in York, including St Andrew's Counselling and Psychotherapy Service;
- Practice merger between York Medical Group and Minister Health;
- Clinical Commissioning Group plans for re-commissioning of Community Services and Out of Hours GP Services

30. They also met with representatives of York Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust; Vale of York Clinical Commissioning Group; Leeds and York Partnership NHS Foundation Trust; Yorkshire Ambulance Service; Adult Social Care and NHS England for joint discussions on how they work together, and received reports from the Chief Executive of York Teaching Hospital NHS Foundation Trust on the Francis Report and Liverpool Care Pathway.

31. Finally, they received a number of reports and presentations i.e.:

- A presentation from the Care Quality Commission on changes to the way they inspect and regulate care services;
- A presentation on loneliness by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation / Joseph Rowntree Housing Trust Neighbourhood Approaches to Loneliness Team;
- Leeds and York Partnership NHS Foundation Trust Annual Report;
- York Teaching Hospital NHS Foundation Trust Annual Report;
- Yorkshire Ambulance Service Annual Report;
- Health & Wellbeing Board Annual Report

32. The Learning & Culture Overview & Scrutiny Committee received:

- York Museums Trust Bi-annual Partnership Delivery Plan Reports;
- York Theatre Royal Bi-annual Service Level Agreement Performance reports;
- Bi-annual Progress Reports on Safeguarding and Looked After Children;
- A school improvement and Ofsted update report;
- A report on safely reducing York's looked after children population;

33. In addition the Committee received presentations from the Chair of York @ Large on the ongoing work of York @ Large and how it works with the Council and other partners to deliver joint services, and the Chair of

Learning City York Partnership about “Unlocking York Talent”, the city’s first All Age Skills Strategy.

Acting as Critical Friend

36. During the municipal year 2013-14 each of the Overview & Scrutiny Committees met with the relevant Cabinet Members to hear about their challenges and priorities for the year. They also met with some of the council’s appropriate statutory partners to hear about their priorities and challenges.

Monitoring Previous Recommendations

37. Finally, each of the committees received bi-annual updates on the implementation of the approved recommendations arising from their previously completed scrutiny reviews. Those deemed to be fully completed were signed off.

Calling - In

38. Throughout the municipal year 2013-14 there were six Cabinet/ Cabinet Member decisions called-in for consideration by CSMC. All the decisions were upheld. The items called-in were:
 - West Yorkshire Plus York Transport Fund;
 - Alternative services to those currently provided by Toy Bus;
 - The Co-operative Council – a community benefit for libraries and archives;
 - 20mph in the west of York – speed limit order and consultation response;
 - Working closer with Leeds Bradford International Airport;
 - Winter maintenance review for the 2013/14 season;
 - Local Plan Consultation – Further Sites;
 - City Centre Competitiveness

Implications

39. There are no known legal, HR and financial implications associated with the recommendation within this report.

Risk Management

40. There are no known risks associated with the recommendation in this report.

Recommendation

41. Having considered the information within this report, Members are asked to approve this Annual Scrutiny Report which covers the period between June 2013 and May 2014, so that it may be presented to full Council in July 2014.

Reason: To enable its presentation to Full Council, in line with Constitutional requirements.

Contact Details

Author:

Steve Entwistle
Scrutiny Officer
Tel: 01904 554279

Chief Officer Responsible for the report:

Andrew Docherty
Assistant Director Governance & ICT

Melanie Carr
Scrutiny Officer
Tel: 01904 552054

Report Approved

Date: 23 April 2014

Specialist Implications Officer(s) - None

Wards Affected:

For further information please contact the authors of the report

All



Background Papers: None

Annexes: None